Tightening the Bolt or Nut Makes No Difference

Several times I have been asked, “Does it make any difference in joint tightness if the tightening torque is applied to the bolt or the nut?”

Over the years I have heard a variety of opinions on this subject, but when I researched the question I did not find any written information. I reviewed several documents that refer to the torque calculation \( T = DPK \) and none of them mentioned that this formula, or any other, was applicable only when the torque was applied to just the bolt or just the nut.

Not finding documented answer, I decided to conduct a simple test to see for myself whether applying torque to the bolt provided any different tension in the joint than did applying the torque to the nut.

**THE HYPOTHESIS**

Being a fan of the scientific method, I first formed a hypothesis, I hypothesized that whether the torque is applied to the bolt or to the nut the tension would be virtually the same.

**THE TESTS**

I then conducted some simple torque-tension tests to obtain my observations upon which I could test my hypothesis.

I tested six 1/4-20 Grade 5 zinc plated bolts and nuts using a calibrated hydraulic tension tester and a calibrated torque wrench. I referred to a recommended tightening torque chart based on the formula \( T = DPK \) and found that the recommended tightening value for the bolts and nuts of this size, grade, and finish is 10 foot-pounds.

I then conducted three tests in which I applied the 10 foot-pounds of torque to the nut and three additional tests in which I applied the torque to the bolt head.

When applying the torque to the nut I place a hardened flat washer under the nut for its bearing surface to rotate on and when applying the torque to the bolt head I placed a hardened washer under the bolt head for its bearing surface to rotate on. I used new bolts, nuts, and washers for each test.

Below are the results obtained from this series of tests:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Tension values obtained when applying 10 foot-pounds of torque to the nut:</th>
<th>Tension values obtained when applying 10 foot-pounds of torque to the bolt head:</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1. 3250 pounds force</td>
<td>1. 3300 pounds force</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2. 3200 pounds force</td>
<td>2. 3100 pounds force</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3. 2800 pounds force</td>
<td>3. 2900 pounds force</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Average: 3083 pounds force</td>
<td>Average: 3100 pounds force</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Note: The difference between 3100 and 3083 is only .5%.
TEST CONCLUSION

Based on these tests it is my opinion that my hypothesis is correct.

The tension created in a particular joint is the same whether the tightening torque is applied to the nut or the bolt, provided the element that is driven (nut or bolt) is seated on a similar surface.